Meta Analysis with R

Dr. Gulser Caliskan Prof. Giuseppe Verlato

Unit of Epidemiology and Medical Statistics Department of Diagnostics and Public Health University of Verona, Italy

INDEX OF LESSON 1

- 1. What is R
- 2. How we can install R
- 3. How R works
- 4. What is Meta-Analysis
- 5. Steps of Meta-Analysis
- 6. Exercise

What Is R?

R is a language and environment for statistical computing and graphics.

R provides a wide variety of statistical (linear and nonlinear modelling, classical statistical tests, time-series analysis, classification, clustering, ...) and graphical techniques, and is highly extensible.

The S language is often the vehicle of choice for research in statistical methodology, and R provides an Open Source route to participation in that activity.

How We Can Install R?

C Download R-4.0.4 for Windows. 1 × +
 C a cran.r-project.org/bin/windows/base/
 R-4.0.4 for Windows (32/64 bit)

Installation and other instructions
New features in this version
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches the package distributed by CRAN, you can compare the md5sum of the .exe to the fingerprint on the master server. You will need a version of md5sum for

Frequently asked questions

- Does R run under my version of Windows?
- How do I update packages in my previous version of R?

windows: both graphical and command line versions are available.

• Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?

Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FAQ</u> for Windows-specific information.

Other builds

- Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>.
- A build of the development version (which will eventually become the next major release of R) is available in the r-devel snapshot build.
- Previous releases

Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows binary release is <<u>CRAN MIRROR>/bin/windows/base/release.html</u>.

Last change: 2021-02-15



R-4.0.4 for Windows (32/64 bit)

Download R 4.0.4 for Windows (85 megabytes, 32/64 bit)

Installation and other instructions New features in this version

If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches the package distributed by CRAN, you can compare the <u>md5sum</u> of the .exe to the <u>fingerprint</u> or and <u>command line versions</u> are available.

Frequently asked questions

- <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u>
- How do I update packages in my previous version of R?
- Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?

Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FAQ</u> for Windows-specific information.



← → C cran.r-project.org/bin/windows/base/

R-4.0.4 for Windows (32/64 bit)

Download R 4.0.4 for Windows (85 megabytes, 32/64 bit) Installation and other instructions New features in this version	Setup - R for Windows 4.0.4 - X	
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches t and <u>command line versions</u> are available.	You should be logged in as an administrator when installing R Note: A full R installation requires administrative privileges, and it appears that those are not available. If you continue with this installation, you will not be able to associate R with .RData files. Installation must be made to a directory where you have write permission.	ıe
 <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u> <u>How do I update packages in my previous version of R?</u> <u>Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?</u> Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FA</u> 		
 Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>. A build of the development version (which will eventually become the <u>Previous releases</u>) Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows <a href="https://www.ccranwide.ccran</td><td>Next > Cancel</td><td></td>	Next > Cancel	

R-4.0.4 for Windows (32/64 bit)

Download R 4.0.4 for Windows (85 megabytes, 32/64 bit)	🖅 Satura - Difan Windows 40.4	
Installation and other instructions New features in this version	Information	
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches	Please read the following important information before continuing.	the fingerprint on t
and <u>command line versions</u> are available.	When you are ready to continue with Setup, click Next.	
 <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u> <u>How do I update packages in my previous version of R?</u> <u>Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?</u> 	Copyright (C) 1989, 1991 Free Software Foundation, Inc. 51 Franklin St, Fifth Floor, Boston, MA 02110-1301 USA Everyone is permitted to copy and distribute verbatim copies of this license document, but changing it is not allowed.	
Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FA</u>	Preamble	
 Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>. A build of the development version (which will eventually become the <u>Previous releases</u> 	The licenses for most software are designed to take away your freedom to share and change it. By contrast, the GNU General Public License is intended to guarantee your freedom to share and change free softwareto make sure the software is free for all its users. This General Public License applies to most of the Free Software	
Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows < <u>CRAN MIRROR>/bin/windows/base/release.html</u> .	< Back Next > Cancel	

R-4.0.4 for Windows (32/64 bit)

Download R 4.0.4 for Windows (85 megabytes, 32/64 bit) Installation and other instructions	B Setup - R for Windows 4.0.4 − □ ×
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches t and command line versions are available.	Select Destination Location Where should R for Windows 4.0.4 be installed?
 <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u> How do Lupdate packages in my previous version of R? 	Setup will install R for Windows 4.0.4 into the following folder. To continue, click Next. If you would like to select a different folder, click Browse. C:\Users\clsgsr12\Documents\R\R-4.0.4 Browse
• <u>Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?</u> Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FA</u>	
 Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>. A build of the development version (which will eventually become the <u>Previous releases</u>) Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows 	At least 2,5 MB of free disk space is required. < Back
Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows <a>	

Installation and other instructions New features in this version	谩 Setup - R for Windows 4.0.4	- 🗆 ×	
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches t	Which components should be installed?	R	the fingerprint
and <u>command line versions</u> are available.	Select the components you want to install; clear the components you install. Click Next when you are ready to continue.	do not want to	
 <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u> <u>How do I update packages in my previous version of R?</u> <u>Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?</u> Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FA</u> 	User installation Core Files 32-bit Files 64-bit Files Message translations	88,2 MB 50,8 MB 57,6 MB 7,3 MB	
 Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>. A build of the development version (which will eventually become the <u>Previous releases</u> Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows 	Current selection requires at least 206, 1 MB of disk space.	> Cancel	

Download R 4.0.4 for Windows (85 megabytes, 32/64 bit)	😥 Setup - R for Windows 4.0.4 — 🗆 🗙	
Installation and other instructions New features in this version	Startup options Do you want to customize the startup options?	
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches t and <u>command line versions</u> are available.	Please specify yes or no, then click Next.	the <u>fingerpr</u>
	 Yes (customized startup) No (accept defaults) 	
 <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u> <u>How do I update packages in my previous version of R?</u> <u>Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?</u> 		
Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FA</u>		
 Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>. A build of the development version (which will eventually become the <u>Previous releases</u> 		_
Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows <a> <a><a><a><a><a><a><a><a><a><a><a><a><a< td=""><td>< Back Next > Cancel</td><td></td></a<>	< Back Next > Cancel	

R-4.0.4 for Windows (32/64 bit)

Download R 4.0.4 for Windows (85 megabytes, 32/64 bit) Installation and other instructions New features in this version	Belect Start Menu Folder	
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches t and <u>command line versions</u> are available.	Where should Setup place the program's shortcuts?	the <u>fingerp</u> ı
 <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u> <u>How do I update packages in my previous version of R?</u> <u>Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?</u> Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FA</u> 	To continue, click Next. If you would like to select a different folder, click Browse.	
 Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>. A build of the development version (which will eventually become the <u>Previous releases</u> Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows <<u>CRAN MIRROR>/bin/windows/base/release.html</u>. 	Don't create a Start Menu folder 	

Download R 4.0.4 for Windows (85 megabytes, 32/64 bit) Installation and other instructions New features in this version	Select Additional Tasks	
If you want to double-check that the package you have downloaded matches t and <u>command line versions</u> are available.	Which additional tasks should be performed? Select the additional tasks you would like Setup to perform while installing R for Windows 4.0.4, then click Next.	the <u>fingerpr</u>
 <u>Does R run under my version of Windows?</u> <u>How do I update packages in my previous version of R?</u> <u>Should I run 32-bit or 64-bit R?</u> Please see the <u>R FAQ</u> for general information about R and the <u>R Windows FA</u> 	Additional shortcuts: Create a desktop shortcut Create a Quick Launch shortcut Registry entries: Save version number in registry	
 Patches to this release are incorporated in the <u>r-patched snapshot build</u>. A build of the development version (which will eventually become the <u>Previous releases</u>) Note to webmasters: A stable link which will redirect to the current Windows <u>CRAN MIRROR>/bin/windows/base/release.html</u>. 	< Back Next > Cancel	

How R Works?



Figure 1: A schematic view of how R works.

Assignments

R, like other computer languages, has *symbolic variables*, that is names that can be used to present values. To assign the value 2 to the variable x,

>x<-2

The two characters <- should be read as a single symbol: an arrow pointing to the variable to which value is assigned. This is know as the *assignment operator*.

PACKAGES IN R

The following table lists the standard packages which are distributed with a base installation of R. Some of them are loaded in memory when R starts; this can be displayed with the function search:

```
> search()
```

- [1] ".GlobalEnv" "package:stats"
- [4] "package:grDevices" "package:utils"
- [7] "package:methods"
- "Autoloads"

"package:graphics" "package:datasets" "package:base"

base datasets grDevices graphics grid methods	base R functions base R datasets graphics devices for base and grid graphics base graphics grid graphics definition of methods and classes for R objects and program- ming tools
splines stats stats4 tcltk tools utils	regression spline functions and classes statistical functions statistical functions using S4 classes functions to interface R with Tcl/Tk graphical user interface elements tools for package development and administration R utility functions

Package	Description
boot	resampling and bootstraping methods
class	classification methods
cluster	clustering methods
foreign	functions for reading data stored in various formats (S3,
	Stata, SAS, Minitab, SPSS, Epi Info)
KernSmooth	methods for kernel smoothing and density estimation (in-
	cluding bivariate kernels)
lattice	Lattice (Trellis) graphics
MASS	contains many functions, tools and data sets from the li-
	braries of "Modern Applied Statistics with S" by Venables
	& Ripley
mgcv	generalized additive models
nlme	linear and non-linear mixed-effects models
nnet	neural networks and multinomial log-linear models
rpart	recursive partitioning
spatial	spatial analyses ("kriging", spatial covariance,)
survival	survival analyses

¹⁸http://cran.r-project.org/src/contrib/PACKAGES.html

How We Can Install Package?

RGui (64-bit)

File Edit View Misc Packages Windows Help

🖻 🗗 🖬 🖺 🗘 💿 🎒



D X

😨 RGui (64-bit)

File Edit View Misc Packages Windows Help

- 0 ×

🖻 🗗 🖬 🖪 🗘 🐵 🎒 82 R Console Packages R version 4.0.4 (2021-02-15) -- "Lost Library Book" IsoplotR IsoplotRgui Copyright (C) 2021 The R Foundation for Statistical Computing ISOpureR Platform: x86 64-w64-mingw32/x64 (64-bit) isoreader IsoriX R is free software and comes with ABSOLUTELY NO WARRANTY. IsoSpecR You are welcome to redistribute it under certain conditions. isoSurv Type 'license()' or 'licence()' for distribution details. isotone isotonic.pen Natural language support but running in an English locale IsotopeR isotree R is a collaborative project with many contributors. ISOweek Type 'contributors()' for more information and ispd 'citation()' on how to cite R or R packages in publications. isqg ISR3 ISRaD Type 'demo()' for some demos, 'help()' for on-line help, or 'help.start()' for an HTML browser interface to help. istacr ISTATS Type 'q()' to quit R. isva **ISwR** > install.packages() italy --- Please select a CRAN mirror for use in this session --itan itcSegment itemanalysis iteRates iterators iterLap < iterpc itertools itertools2 ITGM ITNr iTOP itraxR ITRLearn ITRSelect its.analysis itsadug \sim OK Cancel

 \checkmark Type here to search

O 🛱 💽 🧮 🔒 🕿 😔 😰 🛷 🧿



META ANALYSIS PACKAGES

▶install.packages("haven")

▶install.packages("meta")

➢install.packages("metafor")

▶install.packages("rmeta")

➢install.packages("dmetar")

WHAT IS META-ANALYSIS?

A statistical analysis that combines or integrates the results of several independent clinical trials considered by the analyst to be combinable. It widely accepted as a method of summarizing the results of empirical studies within the behavioral, social and health sciences.

A set of methods to systematically and reproducibly search, sample and (statistically) synthesize evidence from studies.

STEPS OF META ANALYSIS

- Specify Problem
- Search for and Identify Studies
- ≻Enter studies into database
- Select Studies for Review
- Abstract / Code Studies
- ► Select Effect Size Statistic
- ➢ Transform and Weight Effect Sizes
- ► Assess heterogeneity
- Assess Bias
- Synthesize and Present Results

SELECT EFFECT SIZE STATISTIC

Comparable, standardized numeric scale for evidence across disparate studies

Amenable to calculation of standard error
Allows weighting of study's contribution to evidence based on sample size

Different ES's for different kind of outcomes

>Different statistical methods for same ES

Kinds of Effect Statistics

>Proportion

Central tendencies

>Standardized mean difference (d)

Group contrasts of continuous measures

Correlation coefficient (r)

Linear associations

≻Odds-ratio

Group contrasts of dichotomous measures

TRANSFORM AND WEIGHT THE EFFECT STATISTIC

➤Transform

- magnitude and direction of the effect
- same scale for all studies

➤Weight

- inverse variance gives more 'weight' to larger studies
- sample size is key ("n = "precision)
- standard error
 - means, correlations, proportions, odds

- not well-suited to complex procedures like multiple logistic regression

Why Weight Effect Sizes?

≻Studies vary in size.

➢ES based on 100 subjects assumed more "precise" estimate of population ES than ES based on 10 subjects.

≻Larger studies *should* carry more "weight".

>Weighting by the *inverse variance* optimal approach

Fixed Effects vs. Random Effects

Two statistical approaches to calculating the variance for the weighted mean effect statistic.

Fixed Effects

Variance of synthesized effect statistic based only on studies included in the analysis

Random Effects

Variance of synthesized effect statistic based on idea that studies included in the analysis are a random *sample* of all possible studies that could have been included "conservative" vs. "abstruse and uninformative"

Fixed Effects Model

"What is the effect size based solely on the evidence of the studies included in the meta-analysis?"

≻Total variance measured only on basis of within-study variance

Studies weighted on basis of their inverse variance (sample size)

>Approach recommended by Sir Richard Peto and others

Random Effects Model

"What is the average effect size based on the studies included in the meta-analysis *as a sample* of all possible studies?"

≻Total variance includes between-study as well as within-study variance

➤As between-study variance becomes larger (heterogeneity) dominates, swamps within-study variance and all studies weighted equally collection of separate studies vs. sample from underlying population of studies!

Fixed Effects vs. Random Effects

When there is little or no heterogeneity, essentially return the same results

Random effects models do not 'control' for heterogeneity, rather they are assuming a different underlying model.

Some researchers believe that when there is evidence of heterogeneity, shouldn't'combine studies at all.

Caution if random effects return meaningfully different results from fixed effects

ASSESSING HETEROGENEITY

Test the assumption that all effect sizes are measuring a single, underlying mean.

≻Cochran's Q test

>I² index

- 0% to 40%: might not be important;
- 30% to 60%: may represent moderate heterogeneity*;
- 50% to 90%: may represent substantial heterogeneity*;
- 75% to 100%: considerable heterogeneity*.

ASSESSING BIAS

Some biases are peculiar to meta-analysis.

Positive results are more likely to be!
> Published (publication bias)
> Published quickly (time lag bias)
> Published in English (language bias)
> Published more than once
> Be cited by others (citation bias)

will be present to some extent in all meta analyses. Need to assess *how much* of a problem it is.

PRESENTING RESULTS

≻ <u>Abstract</u>

- Background (include statement of the main research question)
- Methodology/Principal Findings
- Conclusions/Significance
- ➤ Introduction
- ➤ Methods
 - Searching describe information sources, restrictions
 - Selection inclusion and exclusion criteria
 - Data abstraction
 - Validity Assessment
 - Study characteristics e.g. type of study designs, participants' characteristics
 - Quantitative data synthesis measures of effect, method of combining results, missing data; how statistical heterogeneity was assessed

≻ <u>Results</u>

- Flow of included studies
- Study characteristics
- Quantitative data synthesis- agreement on the selection and validity assessment, simple summary results, Funnel plots, Forest plots

➤ <u>Discussion</u>

➤ <u>Limitations</u>

EXAMPLE:

IMPORTING DATASET FROM STATA

> setwd("S:/_STAFF/Gulser/R NOTES/META ANALYSIS/data")
> dataset<-read_dta('all832525.dta')
> attach(dataset)

> summary(dataset)

Author Length:9		year		nTreat		mean	meanTreat		sdTreat		nCont		meanCont	
		Min.	:2000	Min.	: 5.00	Min.	:207.0	Min.	:24.20	Min.	: 7.00	Min.	:163.0	
Class :c	haracter	lst Qu	.:2003	lst Q	u.: 10.00	lst Qu	.:232.0	lst Qu	.:30.00	lst Qu	.: 18.00	lst Qu	.:227.0	
Mode :c	haracter	Median	:2006	Media	n : 14.00	Median	:295.0	Median	:60.00	Median	: 35.00	Median	:230.6	
		Mean	:2006	Mean	: 27.78	Mean	:290.5	Mean	:54.72	Mean	: 40.78	Mean	:230.0	
		3rd Qu	.:2008	3rd Qu	u.: 32.00	3rd Qu	.:351.0	3rd Qu	.:67.00	3rd Qu	.: 45.00	3rd Qu	.:246.0	
		Max.	:2010	Max.	:100.00	Max.	:394.0	Max.	:93.00	Max.	:143.00	Max.	:272.0	

sdCont

Min. : 13.70

1st Qu.: 23.00

Median : 65.00

Mean : 64.21

3rd Qu.: 94.00

Max. :125.00

> m<-metacont(nTreat, meanTreat, sdTreat, nCont, meanCont, sdCont, studlab=paste(Author, year), data=dataset,prediction=TRUE, sm="SMD")
> m

	SMD		95%-CI	%W(fixed)	%W(random)
Yamaguchi et al 2000	4.9370	[3.7759;	6.0982]	2.8	10.5
Schibata et al 2003	4.1199	[2.2681;	5.9718]	1.1	7.7
Balzano et al 2003	-0.3068	[-0.8606;	0.2470]	12.4	12.8
Su et al 2004	6.7789	[3.8744;	9.6835]	0.5	4.6
Muller et al 2006	0.4257	[-0.0177;	0.8692]	19.4	13.1
Crippa et al 2007	0.3392	[-0.0148;	0.6933]	30.4	13.4
Ocuin et al 2008	0.9241	[0.1694;	1.6788]	6.7	12.1
Shikano et al 2009	0.5647	[0.0467;	1.0826]	14.2	12.9
Lee et al 2010	0.1838	[-0.3654;	0.7331]	12.6	12.8

Number of studies combined: k = 9

 SMD
 95%-CI
 z
 p-value

 Fixed effect model
 0.5281
 [0.3330; 0.7231]
 5.31 < 0.0001</td>

 Random effects model
 1.4180
 [0.6480; 2.1880]
 3.61
 0.0003

 Prediction interval
 [-1.2550; 4.0910]
 [
 [0.2500]
 []
 []

Quantifying heterogeneity:

tau^2 = 1.1235 [1.1753; 12.5642]; tau = 1.0599 [1.0841; 3.5446] I^2 = 92.0% [87.1%; 95.1%]; H = 3.54 [2.78; 4.50]

Test of heterogeneity: Q d.f. p-value 100.25 8 < 0.0001</pre>

Details on meta-analytical method:

- Inverse variance method
- DerSimonian-Laird estimator for tau^2
- Jackson method for confidence interval of tau^2 and tau
- Hedges' g (bias corrected standardised mean difference)

FOREST PLOT

	Experimental Con				Control	Standa	ardised Mean			
Study	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Di	fference	SMD	95%-Cl
Yamaguchi et al 2000 Schibata et al 2003	10	355.60	27.3000	47	272.00	13.7000			4.94	[3.78; 6.10]
Balzano et al 2003	32	207.00	57.0000	21	228.00	81.0000	-	·	-0.31	[-0.86; 0.25]
Su et al 2004 Muller et al 2006	5 40	394.00 304.00	24.2000 73.0000	11 40	230.60 260.00	22.2000 125.0000	÷		→ 6.78 0.43	[3.87; 9.68] [-0.02; 0.87]
Crippa et al 2007 Ocuin et al 2008	100 13	248.00 232.00	60.0000 93.0000	45 18	227.00 163.00	65.0000 54.0000	╼╸ ╎╴╴╴	-	0.34 0.92	[-0.01; 0.69] [0.17; 1.68]
Shikano et al 2009 Lee et al 2010	26 14	295.00 228.00	61.0000 67.0000	35 143	246.00	100.0000 94.0000	#- #-		0.56 0.18	[0.05; 1.08]
Eived effect model	250	220.00	01.0000	367	211.00	01.0000			0.53	[0.33.0.72]
Random effects model	200			507			<	>	1.42	[0.65; 2.19]
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 92\%$, τ^2	= 1.12	35, p < 0).01							[-1.25; 4.09]
							-2 0	2 4 6		

Weight Weight

10.5%

7.7%

12.8%

4.6%

13.1%

13.4%

12.1%

12.9%

12.8%

1**00.0%**

--

95%-Cl (fixed) (random)

2.8%

1.1%

0.5%

30.4%

-0.31 [-0.86; 0.25] 12.4%

0.43 [-0.02; 0.87] 19.4%

0.92 [0.17; 1.68] 6.7%

0.56 [0.05; 1.08] 14.2%

0.18 [-0.37; 0.73] 12.6%

0.53 [0.33; 0.72] 100.0%

RADIAL PLOT

> radial(m)



Inverse of standard error



Hedges' g

> metabias(m)
Warning message:
Number of studies (k=9) too small to test for small study effects (k.min=10). Change argument 'k.min' if appropriate.

```
> metabias(m, k.min=9, method="Egger")
Linear regression test of funnel plot asymmetry
```

```
Test result: t = 3.58, df = 7, p-value = 0.0090
```

Sample estimates: bias se.bias intercept se.intercept 5.9217 1.6542 -1.0482 0.4940

Details:

- multiplicative residual heterogeneity variance (tau^2 = 5.0594)
- predictor: standard error
- weight: inverse variance
- reference: Egger et al. (1997), BMJ

```
> metabias(m, k.min=9, method="Thompson")
Linear regression test of funnel plot asymmetry
```

```
Test result: t = 6.16, df = 7, p-value = 0.0005
```

```
Sample estimates:
bias se.bias intercept se.intercept
6.1342 0.9962 -1.1036 0.4338
```

Details:

- additive residual heterogeneity variance (tau² = 0.3703)
- DerSimonian-Laird estimator for tau^2
- predictor: standard error
- weight: inverse variance
- reference: Thompson & Sharp (1999), Stat Med

> trimfill(m)

	SMD		95%-CI	%W(random)
Yamaguchi et al 2000	4.9370	[3.7759;	6.0982]	8.7
Schibata et al 2003	4.1199	[2.2681;	5.9718]	7.1
Balzano et al 2003	-0.3068	[-0.8606;	0.2470]	9.7
Su et al 2004	6.7789	[3.8744;	9.6835]	5.0
Muller et al 2006	0.4257	[-0.0177;	0.8692]	9.8
Crippa et al 2007	0.3392	[-0.0148;	0.6933]	9.9
Ocuin et al 2008	0.9241	[0.1694;	1.6788]	9.4
Shikano et al 2009	0.5647	[0.0467;	1.0826]	9.8
Lee et al 2010	0.1838	[-0.3654;	0.7331]	9.7
Filled: Schibata et al 2003	-3.4665	[-5.3184;	-1.6147]	7.1
Filled: Yamaguchi et al 2000	-4.2836	[-5.4448;	-3.1225]	8.7
Filled: Su et al 2004	-6.1255	[-9.0301;	-3.2210]	5.0

Number of studies combined: k = 12 (with 3 added studies)

 SMD
 95%-CI
 z p-value

 Random effects model 0.3418 [-0.5738; 1.2574] 0.73
 0.4644

 Prediction interval
 [-3.0989; 3.7825]

Quantifying heterogeneity: tau^2 = 2.1664 [2.5314; 19.4562]; tau = 1.4719 [1.5911; 4.4109] 1^2 = 94.5% [92.0%; 96.2%]; H = 4.26 [3.55; 5.13]

Test of heterogeneity:

Q d.f. p-value 199.98 11 < 0.0001

Details on meta-analytical method:

- Inverse variance method
- DerSimonian-Laird estimator for tau^2
- Jackson method for confidence interval of tau^2 and tau
- Trim-and-fill method to adjust for funnel plot asymmetry